

***Biblioteka L'va Nikolaevicha Tolstogo v Iasnoi Poliane. Bibliograficheskoe opisanie: III knigi na inostrannykh iazykakh.* Ed. in chief N. V. Kotrelev. Tula: Iasnaia Poliana, 1999. Pt. I 700 pp., Pt. II 670 pp.**

C. J. G. Turner

The University of British Columbia

Long awaited with eager anticipation, the third volume of the *Catalogue of L. N. Tolstoy's Library in Iasnaia Poliana* has now appeared. It was preceded by vol. I in two Parts containing books in Russian (Moscow: Kniga, 1972-75) and vol. II containing periodical publications in Russian (Moscow: Kniga, 1978). Still to come are vols. IV (periodical publications in foreign languages) and V (items other than printed books, e.g., maps, music, manuscripts, postcards). The editorial team gracefully acknowledges the financial assistance of the Italia-Russia Association of Bologna, and of Professor Pier Cesare Bori and Alba Parietti in particular, during the "difficult years" of 1993-95. In future I shall refer to the published volumes by Roman numerals, to their Parts by the letters A or B, to their pages by Arabic numerals; "no(s).xxx" refers to individual items, which, in III alone, can vary in length from one page (e.g., no.2618) to the forty volumes of Goethe's *Werke* (no.1247). PSS will refer to the Jubilee Edition of Tolstoy's Works (Moscow, 1928-58) with the volume first, followed by the page number.

In one sense the title is a misnomer, since, besides the books inherited from his parents or grandparents (e.g., the copy of Thomas à Kempis that belonged to his mother, III B no.3238), some are inscribed to or by Tolstoy's wife (although Bulgakov's Foreword to I says that books found in her bookcase are not included) and others to or by one or other of his children (e.g., one edition of Tolstoy's *Новая Азбука* is inscribed to little Vanya, I B 328), and the single

novel by Paul de Kock (III A no.1794) is touchingly inscribed by T. A. Ergol'skaia "Dernier cadeau de Nicolas" (sc. Tolstoy's father); i.e., the library is that of the Tolstoy family and household, a collection to which Tolstoy had immediate access until almost the end of his life. An increasing number of books, especially those presented by their author, translator, or publisher (whose inscriptions are usually laudatory but occasionally the reverse: e.g., "to the hapless maniac Tolstoy," (I A no.1115), flooded into the household, so that most of them date from after 1880, very many from after 1900, and many from just the last two years of Tolstoy's life. The cut-off date for this catalogue is 1910, the year in which a number of evangelical writings came from E. I. Chertkova, although some titles are included that were published at the end of that year after Tolstoy's actual death (e.g., III B no.3723); the earliest publication date seems to be 1613 (III B no.2575: Philo of Alexandria).

One of the great advantages to be derived from this publication is that it serves as a guide to what Tolstoy did or did not read. Not that it is an infallible guide, since some books are known to have disappeared from the library not so much during World War II, when the library was evacuated while German troops occupied Iasnaia Poliana and fire destroyed two bookcases, but earlier and during Tolstoy's lifetime. Similarly, he is known to have read many books that are not found in the library (e.g., I. M. Snegirev's *Русские в своих пословицах* was a favourite of Tolstoy but is not found in the library, I B 246; cf. the reference to Carroy, *Les Orphelines* in III B 222 no.2677). Even when a given item is present in the library, one has to observe its date of publication and any evidence for when it arrived in the library, and often enough the whole or parts are uncut. On the other hand, often enough the books are marked by Tolstoy in typical ways that would horrify modern librarians: he would turn the corners down, make marks in the margins with pen, pencil or fingernail, underline words, pass comments. Usually a marking signifies his approval or at least that there is something there worth thinking about; sometimes, against a foreign

word, it is a simple vocabulary note (e.g., Homer's *Odyssey*, III A no.1583). Numerals in the margin can be a measure of approval (i.e. graded from 0 to 5+, e.g., Leonid Andreev's stories in I A 38-41) or simply sequential, perhaps marking passages to be copied out. Negative comments, such as *злупо, ченуха* or *аї-аї!*, are relatively rare, while N.B. or question-marks are much more common, including his notorious question-mark against the stage-direction "Enter Ghost" in *Hamlet* (III B 343), after which it is ironical to find an offprint, from the *Publications of the Modern Language Association of America* (1907) no less, of an article on 'The Objectivity of the Ghosts in Shakespeare' (III B 391). The editors are not always sure that the markings are by Tolstoy himself, but it is surprising how often they are certain and sometimes there is a confirmatory note to this effect by V. F. Bulgakov or D. P. Makovitsky, sometimes giving also a date of when Tolstoy was reading the given work.

I-II aim at giving a bibliographic description of each item, an indication of its condition, a careful record of marks made by Tolstoy in the text, and various notes derived from other sources about when Tolstoy read what (e.g., I A 48 gives details of his reading of Matthew Arnold) or which materials were used by him for his own compositions etc. Works published under a pseudonym or initials are listed under such with the real name of the author given in square brackets and a cross-reference under that name. This policy is reversed in III, where any pseudonym is given after the title and cross-references are abandoned. Each item now begins with a bibliographic description of the edition of which it is an example, followed by a more detailed description of its condition (some "catastrophic restoration" is deplored in the Foreword); the description includes inscriptions by authors or donors and insertions (e.g., cards, dried flowers). In some cases the condition of the item is such that it can scarcely be described or identified: e.g., III A nos. 90, 333, 691, and 852. The record of Tolstoy's markings is made more precisely; and references in earlier catalogues and the present location of the item are added. The practice of giving information derived from other sources, helpful as it

was, is discontinued as inherently infeasible. A few bilingual texts (e.g., Lucian, no.2085) are consciously repeated from I.

While I and III include occasional papers, offprints, sermons, tracts, pamphlets etc., II includes not only periodical series, whether appearing regularly or irregularly (сборники, the proceedings of various societies etc.), but also sundry groups of publications such as all those of the Academy of Sciences. It also includes works published abroad in Russian, such as Chertkov's *Листки Свободного слова* (no. 171). Several of them are complimentary copies containing pieces written by Tolstoy. An Appendix (183-84) includes maps and atlases. Much space in this volume simply records that pages were not cut or that their corners were turned down. But the familiar markings by Tolstoy give evidence of what gained his careful reading, especially articles on philosophy and religion, as well as historical sources for his novels (e.g., in III A 644 we find underlined Napoleon's words "senti la vibration de mon mollet gauche. C'est un grand signe chez moi," which Tolstoy used in *Война и мир*, III A 644). It confirms (49-50) one phenomenon that has been known to confuse modern scholars, namely the multiplicity of journals called *Заря*. It also (22) tacitly corrects to 1877 the date of the publication in *Вестник Европы* of A. A. Potekhin's *На миру* from 1887 as given twice in I B 130 no.2472.

To provide a few parameters and a very general description: III alone contains 4181 items. The earliest and latest dates of publication have been given above, as have its shortest and longest items. I counted at least twenty languages represented, including Esperanto, plus a handful of languages that occur only in the section (B 429-86) of Tolstoy's works in translation; and even that is without counting the more than half-dozen languages gathered in a special section (B 641-68) of books that could not be alphabeticised because they are neither in Russian nor in the Latin alphabet; Greek is always transliterated and Greek authors and titles are included in the main section. The author represented by the most items turns out to be Charles Voysey, with

257 items, mostly sermons preached during 1900-1910 in the Theistic Church (London); this exceeds even the number of translations of Tolstoy's own works (203 plus 34 in the special section: especially numerous are translations into Danish). Voysey was born in the same year as Tolstoy, who expressed (almost) complete agreement with his views in two letters of 1901 (PSS 73: 87, 88: 236). Recurrent topics include: medicine, health and hygiene; Wisdom literature, proverbs and folklore (of various nations); vegetarianism, alcohol and temperance; gardening and farming; mathematics and the natural sciences; children and education; history, ancient and modern (e.g., 38 volumes of Sismondi, B 362-66); economics (including six volumes of Adam Smith in French—mostly uncut! B 367), agrarian and social issues (an article on landholding in Canada occurs at I A 435, cf. Voyeykov's article mentioned on II 113); and, of course, literature and religion, much of it Oriental or Christian of varying degrees of eccentricity. In the nature of the case, III alone contains several publications of the South Africa conciliation committee, with reference not yet to *apartheid* but to the Boer Wars.

Misprints are unfortunately more common in III than in the earlier volumes, no doubt because so much matter is in foreign languages (which are frequently mangled in I and II): I noticed such errors in French, German, Latin, transliterated Greek (the letter *rho* is recurrently represented by the Latin letter *p*, giving us something like *Pussian Stories* in no.1969) and Czech, besides Russian and English. One cluster of examples occurs in the description of no.831: "Braddom M.E. John Marcmont' legacy. Leipzig, [184-?]" should read "Braddon M. E. John Marchmont's legacy. Leipzig, 1864", as in no.2220. Some titles have been perverted: Thackeray's novel has become *The Newcomers* (no.3226), one of Trollope's titles has become *The Australia and New Zeland* (no.3500), the subtitle to Harriet Beecher-Stowe's *Little Foxes* has become [*H*]abits which mark domestic happiness (sc. *mar*; no.209), and one of Tolstoy's own stories in translation by Aylmer Maude has become *How an Imp paid for a Christ* (sc.

Crust; no.3317). The illustration on III B 459 contains a French word that is (excusably) misread on the opposite page as *organissé* but must be *organisée*. Given the frequency of numerals it is likely that a proportion of the digits are incorrect, but that is difficult to check. This volume gives the dates of birth and death of modern authors but omits several that could have been supplied, for instance Tolstoy's English disciple John Kenworthy died in 1948 (A 565-68). I noticed that two different dates are given for the death of Auguste Gratre in nos.1285-86 and that an impossible date is given for a translation of *Семейное счастье* in no.4160.

Another way in which a work of this kind is extremely valuable is based on the principle that, if you show me someone's library, I shall get to know his/her personality. Granted that probably a minority of these books were actually chosen by Tolstoy, but by seeing which ones he read and studied and by perusing his markings and comments in them we can gain a good impression of his views and his personality. To take a couple of examples from I: the texts of the poets held by the library back up the assertion (I B 404) that sometimes "Tolstoy quotes poetry or talks about it: always Pushkin and Tyutchev, also Fet"; hard on the heels of which come Chaadaev, Chertkov and Chekhov (I B 425-44), all of them read and marked by Tolstoy. Simple markings are not much help unless one has a copy of the given item to hand, because only a few words of the passages so marked are given in this guide; underlinings tell us more, both because they are given in full and because they are rarer and so presumably denote closer attention by Tolstoy.

A bare listing of major authors well represented in III will give some idea of Tolstoy's interests and tastes: Braddon (listed under Maxwell), the Brontes, Byron, Cervantes (in French, listed under Servantes), Chateaubriand, Dante, Dickens, Dumas, Gibbon (in French), Goethe, Heine, Herodotus, Homer, Hugo, Ibsen, Kant, Maupassant, Molière, Plato, Plutarch, Racine, Richardson (in French), Sand, Shakespeare, Shaw, Sophocles, Thackeray, Trollope, Vergil, Verne, Voltaire, Wells, Xenophon, and Zola.

Conversely, the following authors seem to me to be underrepresented: Balzac (nothing in French!), Bulwer-Lytton (in view of Tolstoy's high opinion of him, *PSS* 64: 50), Flaubert (only half of *Salambo*), Galsworthy (two volumes of plays), Gaskell (one novel in French), Henry James (only one item), Herbert Spencer (only one item in English, but cf. I B 274-75), and Stendhal (only *Promenades dans Rome*). More indicative are the books that are considerably marked by Tolstoy, among which are: Paul Carus' *The Gospel of Buddha*, Jules Huret's *Enquête sur l'évolution littéraire: conversations avec* [various writers], Louis Martin's *Moralistes anciens*, Angelus Silesius (but most of Tolstoy's inscriptions here are simply translations of the German), *The Mystic Text Book*, Pauthier's *Les Livres sacrés de l'Orient*, *The Sayings of Muhammad*, *Rays of Light from the Talmud*, and Charles Wagner's *La Vie simple*; authors such as Amiel, Marcus Aurelius, Georg Lichtenberg, Montaigne, Max Müller, Pascal, even a volume of speeches by Kaiser Wilhelm II; and parts of the section headed 'Biblia' and of a collection of the Church Fathers, selections also from Homer, Hugo, Kant, the Koran, the Tao of Lao-Tze, Plato, Plutarch, Renan, Rousseau, Schiller, Seneca and Shakespeare. From a perusal of Tolstoy's inscribed comments we gain, for instance, confirmation of his inability to accept, perhaps to comprehend, the concept of divine grace. For III B 124 records the definition of grace as nothing but "la conscience de la participation à la divinité" and on I A 106 he substitutes "try to rid ourselves" for "beseech the Lord to heal us" and "and then let us strive" for "and give us the strength... to strive". Tolstoy knew no Comforter to aid his moral strivings.

One feels the need for some cross-references in III: for instance, a reference under Cervantes to the unusual spelling of his name where his work does appear in French translation (no.2987) and under Braddon to Maxwell (her married name). Indeed, names (chiefly French

names) have caused some difficulties: the author of no.1470 is also the author of 1211-12; nos.2123 and 2578 have the same author and title; and nos.2641 and 2647 have the same author but are separated by another author of the same surname. Nor is it at all clear why Gustav Nieritz' *Der junge Soldat* (no.1710) should not appear with his other works under his name (nos. 2432-37).

Finally, I cannot resist the temptation to list a few curiosities culled from these volumes: The name Levin occurs in a book read by Tolstoy in the 1870s (I A 280). One book is inscribed by its author to Prime Minister Stolypin, who received the copy inscribed to Tolstoy (I A 388 no. 1596). Tolstoy studied the monk Parfeny's account of his travels in about 1878 (I B 92-94), just when Dostoevsky was using it for *Братья Карамазовы*. An instalment of Part IV of *Анна Каренина* is listed in the contents of *Русский Вестник* for February 1876, but the text itself has been "torn out by someone" (II 139). One book (III A 545 no.1694) contains a note by Makovitsky (?) that Tolstoy was "на ты" with Ostrovsky, K. Leont'ev and Chicherin. III A no.1835 is a book about "the moral causes of the Russo-Japanese war" written in English, with a Latin title, by a Chinese and published in Shanghai. III B no. 3301 has a dedicatory sonnet to Tolstoy in French. And III B no. 3400 has a note about his reading into a phonograph (cf. I A 292).

But we have to end by congratulating the editorial team on a thankless task nobly accomplished. 'Thankless' in the sense that much of it must have been a hard, dull slog; but hopefully not thankless either in the sense of not bearing the fruit that it deserves in a better and fuller appreciation of Tolstoy or in the sense of not receiving the gratitude and plaudits of the international scholarly community. III will be of particular interest to comparatists. Its availability earlier would have facilitated and, no doubt, improved my own comments on 'The First Kind of Novelist's Poetry' and 'Tolstoy's Reading, 1869-77'; many others could say as much or more.